

The University of Mississippi Undergraduate Research Journal

Volume 3

Article 3


5-1-2019

Watering the Desert: Azraq, Public Opinion, and Environmental Post-Materialism

Wesley A. Gerard

University of Mississippi, wagerard@go.olemiss.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <https://egrove.olemiss.edu/umurjournal>

 Part of the [International Relations Commons](#), [Natural Resources and Conservation Commons](#), [Near and Middle Eastern Studies Commons](#), [Sustainability Commons](#), and the [Water Resource Management Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Gerard, Wesley A. (2019) "Watering the Desert: Azraq, Public Opinion, and Environmental Post-Materialism," *The University of Mississippi Undergraduate Research Journal*: Vol. 3 , Article 3.

Available at: <https://egrove.olemiss.edu/umurjournal/vol3/iss1/3>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by eGrove. It has been accepted for inclusion in The University of Mississippi Undergraduate Research Journal by an authorized editor of eGrove. For more information, please contact egrove@olemiss.edu.

Watering the Desert: Azraq, Public Opinion, and Environmental Post-Materialism

Cover Page Footnote

I would like to acknowledge the Sally McDonnell Barksdale Honors College for helping me to fund my research in Jordan. Additionally, this research would not have been possible without my mentors at both SIT Study Abroad in Amman and the University of Mississippi, particularly in the Croft Institute for International Studies.

Watering the Desert: Azraq, Public Opinion, and Environmental Post-Materialism

Wesley Gerard

Honors Candidate for B.A. Political Science & B.A. Arabic

Reviewed Dr. Vivian Ibrahim

Croft Associate Professor of History & International Studies

Abstract

This article focuses on physical, socioeconomic, and political changes in the community of Azraq, Jordan. Azraq, a small town in northeastern Jordan, sits atop a large aquifer that has been heavily pumped by the government for several decades in response to an increasing nationwide demand for water. This has led to large-scale transformations in not only the physical landscape surrounding the aquifer, but also in the daily lives, economic statuses, and political opinions of the people living there. My research thus fits the case of Azraq into larger academic discourse on groundwater governance, resource access, and environmentalism. I use a combination of field research I personally conducted in Jordan as well as existing literature to relate the case of Azraq to the theoretical concepts of the tragedy of the commons and postmaterialist environmentalism. I find that Azraq provides new ways of understanding both theories, and provides a significant argument against the post-materialist theory in particular. These findings are important in understanding both the effects of water shortages and groundwater governance on local communities through a number of lenses, as well as the theories of the tragedy of the commons and post-materialist environmentalism in new ways.

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the Sally McDonnell Barksdale Honors College for helping me to fund my research in Jordan. Additionally, this research would not have been possible without my mentors at both SIT Study Abroad in Amman and the University of Mississippi, particularly in the Croft Institute for International Studies.

Introduction

The Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan is one of the poorest countries in the world in terms of water - though there are some discrepancies in different rankings, most sources rank Jordan within the top five most water-poor countries globally. The water shortage in Jordan is a result of many factors: an arid climate, few in-country groundwater sources, poor water management, and disadvantages in international water disputes. In the coming years, water levels in the country will continue to dwindle with the effects of climate change. Spreading desertification throughout the Kingdom only makes research on the water crisis more important. This article is thus a contribution to existing academic literature and thought regarding groundwater access in Jordan, as well as the effects of environmental degradation on environmentalism and political thought in local communities. Specifically, the paper focuses on Azraq, a small, rural town in northeastern Jordan that sits atop a large aquifer.

This thesis analyzes Azraq through two primary theories: the tragedy of the commons (as described by Elinor Ostrom in 1990) and the post-materialist thesis (coined by Ronald Inglehart in 1971). The tragedy of the commons describes the environmental degradation that accompanies extraction from a common resource; Azraq presents a unique case study for this theory, as it is a formerly common resource that has transferred to the control of the government. The post-materialist thesis states that as societies advance and have more of their material needs satisfied, citizens have more free time, thought, and energy to pursue other causes, such as environmentalism. Azraq presents a counterargument to post-materialism as the Azraqi population is very environmentally aware, despite being relatively low-income, because it experiences environmental deg-

radation on a daily basis. My thesis thus answers the question, "Do the changes I and others observed in Azraq create new ways of understanding the tragedy of the commons and environmental post-materialism?"

I chose my research question based on my personal experience living in Jordan, both in the summer of 2017 and in the spring of 2018. When I first visited Jordan, I experienced the water shortage first-hand, as I and my apartment roommates had to remain mindful of how much water we used in order to avoid running out. Each week our building received a certain amount of water, and if we used it all, we had to either purchase more water or wait until the next week to receive more. Having prior academic interests in climate change and the relationship between the environment and politics, I decided to pursue my interests in the Jordanian water shortage further when I returned in the spring semester of 2018 as a part of the School for International Training (SIT). While at SIT, I completed an academic paper on the effects of the water shortage on public opinion in Azraq, finding that the way people experience the water crisis in Azraq seems to make them more environmentally aware and more likely to support government policies to conserve water in Azraq and in Jordan as a whole.

This paper builds upon my work at SIT, using the same survey and interview data in a different way to apply my observations in Azraq to existing literature as well as broader political theory, particularly relating to access to common resources and the causes of environmentalism in rural, low-income areas that are often most impacted by environmental degradation. Thus, in some ways, this paper is a continuation of my previous study in that it further explores the relationship between the water shortage and public opinion in Azraq, asking what ways this case applies to theoretical concepts.

These research topics are particularly important as environmental degradation continues to be a hotbed issue on the stage of international policymaking. As man-made climate change rapidly shows its effects, some world leaders seem committed to finding a way to reverse or at least subdue those effects, while others, notably Donald Trump, seem to want to avoid addressing the issue altogether. The importance of understanding not only the scientific impacts of climate change and water shortages, but also the societal and political implications of these phenomena is incredibly important as these effects will begin to take stronger holds with the passage of time. Perhaps no part of the world will be more greatly affected by these issues than the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region.

Keeping these broad issues in mind, a complete understanding of the town of Azraq is very important in understanding this paper. Historically, Azraq has been known as a desert oasis, a massive lake in the middle of the desert that has played host to several species of unique wildlife, and a place where travelers could stop to rest and admire the scenery. As such, throughout most of history Azraq was somewhat of an agricultural hub, and during my time there I met several farmers whose ancestors had raised unique livestock there, such as cows and water buffalo. Additionally, Azraq once boasted a thriving ecotourism industry, particularly known as a spot for bird-watchers to watch different species of birds as they stopped in Azraq for water during migration (Al-Eisawi, 2009).

However, beginning in the 1960's, Azraq began to change. As the water crisis truly started to take shape the Jordanian government was becoming desperate to find more groundwater resources within its borders. The government began pumping water from the Azraq aquifer, and pipelines

transporting water from Azraq to the capital city, Amman, and Zarqa began use in the early 1980's (Ta'any, 2014). According to the Royal Society for the Conservation of Nature (RSCN), water levels in the aquifer started "to decrease significantly in 1981 and reach[ed] alarming rates in 1993 ("Azraq Wetland Reserve")." Water continues to be pumped from the aquifer, though at less detrimental rates, and the water level in the aquifer has been restored due to about 10% of its original capacity, though achieving much more than this is difficult (Al-Hreisha, 2018).

Outside of physical changes, my interest in Azraq primarily concerns political and societal consequences of pumping on the local community. In this paper I relate my own observations to two main theories: Elinor Ostrom's tragedy of the commons and Ronald Inglehart's post-materialist thesis. In particular, I argue that Azraq provides a new way of understanding the tragedy of the commons, as Azraq has a resource that was once commonly accessed by the community but which has now come under the control of the state. With regards to post-materialism, I use Bryan Tilt's critique of the post-materialist thesis as the basis for my argument, and state that Azraq provides a counterexample to post-materialism. More in-depth explanations of each theory, as well as my methodology and findings, are given in the following sections.

Literature Review

a. The post-materialism theory

My research builds largely upon the post-materialism theory and its counterarguments. The post-materialist thesis was initially coined by Ronald Inglehart in his 1971 book *The Silent Revolution in Europe: Intergenerational Change in Post-industrial*

Societies. In an overview for the American Political Science Review of the main theories and findings of the book, Inglehart wrote that before the modern era, people were "forced to give priority to survival needs," as survival was not guaranteed. But, he argues, "... in advanced industrial societies, ... [the post-war generation] give[s] increasingly high priority to 'Postmaterialist' values such as belonging, self-expression, and free choice." (Inglehart, 1971). Essentially, the theory asserts that as societies become industrialized and wealthy, members of society do not have to devote most of their time to meeting survival needs. As a result, citizens are able to devote their time to "postmaterialist" causes, one of which is the environment. Thus, society as a whole becomes more environmentally aware and more supportive of environmental causes.

Lauren Copeland (2013) also argues that postmaterialist societies are more environmentally aware, particularly due to the rise of "political consumerism" in these societies. Copeland defines "political consumerism" as the practice of buying or not buying products due to political concerns, including whether or not the product is "environmentally friendly." Additionally, Copeland usefully notes that materialism and post-materialism not only apply to whole societies but also to individual ideals, and thus societies are made up of both materialist and post-materialist citizens. In her research, Copeland finds that post-materialists are more likely to engage in political consumerism as well as "all forms of political participation and civic engagement." Post-materialists are thus more likely than their materialist counterparts to care about environmental causes and become involved in environmental movements, simply because they have more time and "psychic energy," as Copeland defines this phenomenon, to contribute to these causes.

A study conducted by Henn, et. al (2017), affirmed Copeland's view, stating that young post-materialists in Britain are more likely to participate in political activism than their older, materialist counterparts. More specifically, post-materialist youth, having become somewhat disillusioned with the political process, are more likely to participate in non-institutionalized forms of political action than are materialists. Post-materialists also felt more comfortable engaging in political discussion with family members or participating in voluntary organizations that engaged in forms of civic engagement or political action.

Booth (2017) later connected post-materialism to environmentalism in a study in which he analyzed the relationship between different variables such as age and political affiliation with postmaterialist ideals, and then the relationship between postmaterialism values and environmentalist values. Essentially, Booth sought to find out if one's age or political affiliation correlated with strong postmaterialist values, or the prioritization of various abstract postmaterialist values as described by Inglehart over more tangible, material values. After understanding the relationship between these human variables and postmaterialism, Booth examined whether or not strong postmaterialist idealism correlated with strong environmentalism. The study found that "the postmaterialism index predicts an increase in the priority of the environment over growth, environmental group inactive and active membership, contributing to an ecological organization, and attending environmental demonstrations." In other words, strong postmaterialists (which Booth finds are more likely to be young people and those who lean politically liberal) are more likely to be concerned with the environment and to play a more active role in the environmental cause.

The postmaterialist thesis is important as a theoretical contribution to the question of what makes people become more environmentally aware and active. The authors mentioned previously assert that post-materialist societies, or individuals with post-materialist values, will have greater concern for the environment and be more likely to participate in environmental political activism than their materialist counterparts. However, my research argues against this notion, as the case of Azraq seems to counter the idea that post-materialists are more concerned about the environment than materialists are. My argument builds on research I conducted in Azraq in the spring of 2018; I found that in Azraq, people's unique experiences of the water crisis caused them to develop negative opinions of government water policy in Jordan as a whole.

b. Arguing against post-materialism: Literature, Azraq, and "the tragedy of the commons"

Bryan Tilt, in *The Struggle for Sustainability in Rural China* (2009), describes research he conducted primarily in the Futian district of the city of Shenzhen, China, focusing on sustainability issues and policy in the country. A primary aspect of the research is the examination of sustainability culture within civil society in both rural and urban areas. Tilt argues against the postmaterialism thesis, which he defines as, "as societies undergo the transition to industrial development and modernity, their citizens begin to concern themselves with needs and wants beyond the material." As discussed previously, supporters of the postmaterialism theory argue that this transition results in greater interest in concerns such as environmentalism.

Tilt, however, presents a counterargument to the postmaterialism thesis, citing a

1992 Gallup poll which found that "citizens of rich and poor countries alike were extremely concerned about the environment." Tilt goes on to discuss the way that two types of environmentalism may be forming - one in the "global North" and one in the "global South." He terms the environmentalism of the global North "full-bellied environmentalism," and describes this as a type of environmentalism that results because of affluence and the ability to care about causes beyond the material. Tilt contrasts this with "empty-bellied environmentalism," the environmentalism of the global South that forms "as people experience directly environmental problems, such as pollution, that continue to be acute in the developing world and are often the result of First World countries externalizing their own environmentally damaging behaviors."

The Nobel Prize - winning political economist Elinor Ostrom also published research contrasting with the postmaterialism theory. In *Governing the Commons* (1990), Ostrom states that in environmental literature, the "tragedy of the commons" has come to symbolize the environmental degradation to be expected whenever many individuals use a scarce resource in common." In other words, as citizens make use of a local environmental resource (the "commons"), environmental degradation will ensue due to the depletion of this natural resource (the "tragedy"). This environmental tragedy of the commons is particularly pertinent in the case of water use, as the depletion of natural water sources can cause severe environmental degradation, which in turn affects the people surrounding the water source. In Azraq, this scarce resource is the aquifer, used in common both by Azraq locals but also by Jordanian citizens in general, which has led to environmental degradation and, by extension, societal and physical changes in Azraq.

Ostrom's exploration of the tragedy

of the commons and its relationship with the environment further reinforces the ways in which the postmaterialism theory fails to hold up in environmental problems in rural, poor areas. If the citizens living around a common natural resource are most affected by its depletion and the environmental degradation caused by the depletion of that resource, it follows that these citizens would be very aware of environmental impacts because they experience those impacts on a daily basis. Thus, Ostrom's tragedy of the commons ties into Tilt's refusal of the postmaterialism theory as the tragedy of the commons explains why and how citizens around a common resource experience environmental degradation, which Tilt argues makes those citizens more environmentally aware.

Brechin and Kempton (1994) argue that the postmaterialism theory has become accepted because it fits a narrative of rich vs. poor nations, allowing both sides of this equation to use environmentalism to their advantage. Rich or developed nations, for example, are able to use postmaterialism to reinforce a stereotype of developing countries as "peasants" and to support industrial projects in developing countries without concern for their environmental effects. Conversely, leaders of developing nations are able to use "We can't afford to worry about the environment" in order to acquire more international aid from developed nations. Because of this, Brechin and Kempton argue that the postmaterialism theory as it relates to environmentalism "has such political utility that it would probably survive without theoretical support."

However, they argue, just because the idea that postmaterialist societies are more environmentally aware has significant political utility does not mean that this theory holds up under closer scrutiny. Similarly to Tilt, Brechin and Kempton assert that rates

of environmentalism will be higher in developing countries than in developed ones. Environmentalism in developing countries, according to the authors, has five possible explanations: "(1) environmental justice and social protest, (2) mass media diffusion of environmental values, (3) direct observation of environmental change and degradation, (4) institutional processes, and (5) the possibility that 'environmentalism' itself has changed, and is now a more materialist value."

This literature on the postmaterialism theory and its counterarguments lays the foundation for my research on how the environmental, political, and societal situation in Azraq relates to postmaterialism theory. Postmaterialism is an explanation that works in certain wealthy countries that have high levels of environmental awareness and activism, but the theory fails to apply in other cases. In this paper, I argue that the postmaterialism theory does not apply in Azraq, but rather that Azraq is an example of environmentalism at work in rural and developed areas. In future sections, I will describe both my methodology in gathering field data in Azraq, as well as existing literature on the economic and political situation in Azraq. Additionally, I will discuss my own findings on in Azraq as well as how the relationship between Azraq and postmaterialism.

Methodology

As stated in the introduction, this study builds upon a previous research project I completed as a part of the School for International Training (SIT). I studied with SIT for a semester-long program in Amman, Jordan, entitled "SIT Jordan: Geopolitics, International Relations, and the Future of the Middle East," during the spring semester of 2018. As a requirement of the program, each student completes a research project

or internship during the final month of the semester. Having previously studied Arabic in Jordan during the summer of 2017, I was aware of the widespread water shortage throughout the country, and thus decided to complete a project that related in some way to water access in rural areas. I decided to focus on Azraq after reading about some of the groundwater resources of Jordan and the unique history of the Azraq aquifer and the community. I completed a research paper entitled “Effects of the Jordanian Water Crisis on Public Opinion: A Case Study in Azraq.” In developing this thesis, I decided to use the survey and interview data I gathered in Azraq, as well as a combination of existing literature and theory related to resource access and environmentalism, to answer a different research question. This section is an explanation of how I gathered my survey and interview data in Jordan and how I related it to existing literature and theory to provide new insights into both water issues within Azraq and Jordan. These results also relate to the fields of water security, resource access, and political ecology.

As the topic for my original work was a question of how the Azraq community’s experience of the water crisis does or does not affect public opinion towards the government among locals, I set out to create a survey that would ask relatively broad questions on these topics and that would be relatively simple and quick to take. I made the survey a short twelve, broad questions as I knew I had a time constraint of only one day to travel to Azraq and complete the surveys, and because I wanted to make sure the survey was easily understandable to everyone participating. I developed the survey in consultation with my primary academic advisor, Dr. Isamel Abuamoud, and my program director, Dr. Raed Al-Tabini, as well as my language instructor, Mrs. Riham al-Naimat, who helped with translation. A full copy of the sur-

vey translated into English can be found in the appendices, though the questions generally asked participants about their general information, the effects of the water crisis on their daily lives, as well as their views on governmental water policy in both Azraq locally and Jordan as a whole.

With the help of the same advisors, I also developed an interview script for farmers in Azraq, in which I asked them about the transformation of the agricultural sector in Azraq since pumping began, as well as how they feel the water shortage has affected their agricultural practices. For my interview with Dr. Al-Hreisha of the Azraq Wetland Reserve, I developed an interview script in which I asked him about the work of the Reserve, government policy in Azraq, as well as the most pressing issues facing the aquifer today and the effects of natural processes such as climate change on the oasis and surrounding community. For my interview with Dr. Adnan Al-Zoubi of the Ministry of Water and Irrigation, I sought to gain a governmental perspective on the water crisis and on pumping from the Azraq aquifer specifically, so I developed questions around these goals. Scripts from my interviews can also be found in the appendices of this article.

Ethical considerations were taken into account and all participants signed an informed consent form which confirmed their anonymity in the study and gave their consent to be used as a part of the study and its final results. The name of each participant was not asked on the survey. Interview participants also signed an informed consent form that allowed them to choose whether or not their name would be displayed in the final project. All interview participants chose to allow their name to be displayed, though only two of their names are included in this study. Additionally, I completed a local IRB review through SIT to conduct my research in Jor-

dan, and have completed an IRB through the University of Mississippi to use the data I gathered in Jordan as existing data in this article.

To deliver the study, I traveled to Azraq with my academic director’s colleague, Mr. Abdullah al-Hweitat, an Azraq resident. I stayed with Mr. Abdullah and his family for one night, and spent the entire day and night of my arrival as well as part of the next morning administering surveys and conducting interviews around the community. Unfortunately, I was only able to gather a convenience sample that consisted primarily of Mr. Abdullah’s acquaintances; this was unavoidable, as if I had attempted to administer the surveys without a local guide it is not likely I would have been able to gain the trust of anybody in the town. However, the sampling of the study is certainly a major limitation and made proving any causal relationships difficult. I do believe that my study with SIT laid some useful groundwork for future studies that have perhaps more time, money, and resources to conduct larger-scale surveys on the relationship between water and politics in rural communities.

When I began this project, I took a second look at my data collection about the water shortage and the relationship between water and politics in a place like Azraq and made connections between my own findings and existing literature. Primarily, I used databases such as JSTOR or EBSCO to find articles about the physical properties of Azraq and the surrounding landscape, as well as the anthropological and geographical history of the area, which helped to give me a more complete reading of the town and the way that the community has historically reacted with both the aquifer and later, the state.

Findings

In the first part of the findings section, I highlight the results of my own personal observations and field research in Azraq. I particularly focus on political transformation in Azraq as well as changes in the physical landscape since government pumping began in the 1980’s. I then discuss some of the future political implications of my own findings in Azraq as well as those of other authors, and the ways in which the case of Azraq can give insight to similar situations regionally and globally. Finally, I relate these findings to broader theories discussed in the literature review, particularly Ostrum’s tragedy of the commons, Inglehart’s postmaterialism thesis, and Tilt’s counterargument of that thesis.

a. Physical changes in Azraq

This subsection is a discussion of the physical changes brought about by over pumping in Azraq. Here, I aim to answer the question, “What do my observations, in tandem with existing literature, reveal in terms of historic physical changes in Azraq?”. Upon arriving in Azraq, I found a landscape very different from what I had expected. Though I knew the history of policy regarding the aquifer, I had not expected the landscape surrounding such a large body of water to be so barren. During my interviews with Chechen farmers whose families had been in Azraq for several generations, I saw pictures of Azraq from the 1960’s and 1970’s which, as I had expected, seemed to show a completely different world from the one I was visiting. Pictures of a massive lake surrounded by lush greenery and wildlife, of people swimming, fishing, or herding water buffalo in the lake really showed how much government pumping had changed the lives of the people in Azraq.

Existing literature highlights physical

transformations in Azraq since government pumping caused drastic decreases in water levels began in 1981. Over the course of the last three to four decades the aquifer dried out, which led to changes both in the physical landscape and in the wildlife that exists in Azraq. Once a thriving oasis, Azraq now looks strikingly similar to the desert that surrounds it and that is spreading across the landscape of Jordan. The road from Amman to Azraq is covered entirely by desert, but Azraq, Arabic for “blue,” is supposed to be a refreshing break from the sand, a thriving oasis in the midst of the vast Jordan desert. However, unless one drives directly to the spot where the little remaining water in the aquifer is found, there is no indication that the Azraq landscape is any different from that of the other desert towns.

One incredibly detrimental physical consequence of the depletion of the Azraq aquifer is the loss of a variety of flora and fauna species that once inhabited the surrounding area. Several species of birds have changed their migratory patterns so that they no longer stop in Azraq, and many species of frogs, butterflies, and dragonflies now no longer live in the area. A species of fish that is known to live only in the Azraq oasis, *aphanius sirhani*, are now critically endangered. The rehabilitation of this species has become a main goal of the Azraq Wetland Reserve. This change in migratory patterns as well as the disappearance of species of various animals has been devastating on the ecosystem as well as on ecotourism to the area. Azraq once hosted a thriving ecotourism industry that primarily revolved around bird-watching, but due to alterations in migration patterns this industry has become virtually nonexistent. The disappearance of the ecotourism industry has led to job loss and to changes in the roles of organizations such as the Azraq Wetland Reserve or the Royal Society for the Conservation of Nature in Azraq, which will

be discussed later on (Al-Eisawi, 2005). Some of my own findings and observations reinforce existing literature which discusses physical transformations in Azraq. For example, during my time in Azraq I was fortunate to interview Dr. Hazem Al-Hreisha, the manager of the Azraq Wetland Reserve. The Reserve was established by the Royal Society for the Conservation of Nature (RSCN) in 1978 in the hopes of conserving the oasis, and is now the main organization working in Azraq to both maintain water levels and rehabilitate species around the aquifer that are beginning to dwindle (“Azraq Wetland Reserve”). My interview with Dr. Al-Hreisha reiterates findings from Dr. El-Eisawi on the departure of migratory birds from Azraq. Dr. Al-Hreisha discusses this exodus of migratory birds as well as the near disappearance of several other animal species. He also frequently emphasized the restoration of these species and the natural ecosystem of the aquifer as the main goal of the Reserve (Al-Hreisha, 2018).

My research also reinforces findings from Al-Naber (2016) which emphasize the effects of excessive pumping from the aquifer on the agricultural sector in Azraq. Additionally, Al-Naber discusses the importance of sustainable agriculture, a theme I also found while interviewing Chechen farmers. Negative effects on the agricultural sector include loss of water for irrigation and the inability to raise certain livestock, such as water buffalo, since pumping from the aquifer reached its peak. Most of these farmers, now over 60 years old, had grown up in the days before pumping and had learned agricultural practices when the water in the aquifer was still bountiful. Throughout their lives, as water levels in the aquifer have continued to deplete, these farmers have been forced to adapt to more sustainable agricultural practices, learn new ways to conserve water, and even abandon some crops and livestock altogether.

er. My findings from speaking to farmers on the ground reinforce the impacts of excessive pumping as discussed by Al-Naber, and help to provide useful insight into the ways that pumping has affected both the Chechen community and the agricultural sector in Azraq as a whole.

b. Political and social changes

In this subsection, I answer the question, “What has changed politically and socially in Azraq due to excessive pumping from the aquifer?”. First, over-pumping has had significant effects on public opinion in Azraq. In my previous study, I examined the relationship between the water shortage itself, government policy, and public opinion. In my 25 surveys and four interviews with local Chechen farmers, I asked questions regarding citizens’ feelings towards how the water crisis has affected their daily lives, towards government water policy in Jordan and in Azraq specifically. A key finding from my research was that locals in Azraq tended to view local government water policy in Azraq less favorably than government water policy in Jordan as a whole. This shows the significant role that water plays in Azraq and the political awareness it fosters. Survey participants were also generally supportive of conservation movements in Azraq and unsupportive of continued pumping from the aquifer.

As discussed in the methodology section, I conducted surveys over the course of two days in Azraq with the help of Mr. Abdullah al-Hweitat and his son Jaafar, who led me to their friends, neighbors, and colleagues around town and asked them to take the survey. All of the citizens that I talked to were rather eager to participate in the study, and seemed to be very opinionated about the issue of water in Azraq. As a whole, participants in the study saw water as

an incredibly important political issue in Jordan and one that greatly affected their daily lives. This is demonstrated through the averages (means), medians, and standard deviations of the responses to two of my survey questions, as highlighted in the table on the following page:

Table 1: The water shortage in the lives of Azraq locals

Question	Number of responses	Mean response	Median response	Standard deviation
On a scale of 1 to 6, with 1 meaning, “non-important,” and 6 meaning, “very important,” how do you view the water crisis compared to other political issues in Jordan?	25	5.64	6	1.06
On a scale of 1 to 6, with 1 meaning, “no effect,” and 6 meaning, “major effect,” what kind of effect has the water crisis had on your daily life?	25	5.24	6	1.16

This data clearly shows the political significance of water within the Azraq community, and reinforces the findings of a study conducted by Janssens and Thill that describes water as the main link between the Jordanian state and Azraqi society. These two authors state that in the unique situation of Azraq, as a rural desert town whose main practical use for the national government these days is as a source of water for the rest of the country, water becomes the primary medium through which locals interact with the state and with the political process. Additionally, water and the way that both citizens and the state interact with it contributes to the formation of political opinion and identity within the community.

The results in the table above reinforce the findings of Janssens and Thill as they show that people in Azraq view water as a very important political issue - I did not conduct surveys in other parts of Jordan, such as Amman or rural areas in the south,

but in Azraq, locals clearly view water as a very important political issue and one that drastically affects their daily life. Other findings from my surveys support Janssens and Thill’s arguments as well, particularly the responses to the following questions:

Table 2: Opinions of government water policy

Question	Number of responses	Mean response	Median response	Standard deviation
On a scale of 1 to 6 with 1 meaning, "I do not agree at all," and 6 meaning, "I agree very strongly," do you agree with the government's water policy in Azraq?	25	2.72	1	2.23
On a scale of 1 to 6 with 1 meaning, "I do not agree at all," and 6 meaning, "I agree very strongly," do you agree with the government's water policy in Jordan as a whole?	25	3.88	4	2.22
How many times a week do you receive water from the government?	24	3.54	4	.66

Proving a causal relationship between government pumping and transformation in public opinion within Azraq is outside of the capability and overall aim of this study, but given this survey data I argue that government pumping from the aquifer likely contributes to the development of public opinion towards the government and water policy more specifically. As the people of Azraq experience the water crisis in a unique way, it seems logically and from the data shown that this experience will help to shape the way they view the water crisis and policy surrounding it.

Another important takeaway from this data is the response to the question asking participants how often they receive water each week. Throughout the Kingdom, a weekly supply of water for drinking, cleaning, bathing, etc., is typically delivered to each household from the government a certain number of times per week. The tenants are then responsible for rationing their water so that they do not run out before the next delivery. An average response of 3.5 is rather high compared to Amman, where I observed

that nearly all apartment complexes only received water once a week, with the most fortunate receiving water twice a week at most. This shows that Azraq locals are well aware of environmental issues despite receiving water more frequently than those in Amman. Governmental exploitation of the aquifer has affected life in Azraq as a whole in ways other than the frequency of household water delivery, as shown by this table.

A political issue that has arisen due to the water shortage in Azraq and in Jordan as a whole is illegal water extraction. People who I interviewed or surveyed, particularly Mr. Hezam al-Hreisha of the Azraq Wetland Reserve and Dr. Adnan al-Zoubi of the Ministry of Water and Irrigation, brought up illegal wells as a significant problem in Jordan. Dr. Al-Zoubi discussed the problems that illegal wells create for the government, as it is difficult to know how much can be pumped from an aquifer when an unknown portion of water is also being pumped illegally. More research needs to be done regarding illegal wells and the significance of their impact on the Jordanian water crisis, though at the very least they are a political consequence of government pumping in Azraq. Reduced water levels in Azraq and the inability of the government to ration as much water to each household as before has led people to search for other means to access water, one of which is illegal extraction (Al-Zoubi, 2018).

A potentially positive political implication of government over pumping in Azraq is increased environmental awareness and the rise of conservation movements. The Azraq Wetland Reserve is a very important organization to the Azraq aquifer and community and works to preserve the current water levels in the aquifer as well as preserve and restore certain wildlife species in and around the aquifer. The Wetland Reserve is a constituent organization of the Royal Society for the Conservation of Nature (RSCN), which

establishes various projects and organizations in parts of Jordan designed to preserve the country’s nature sites. The state of Azraq after over-pumping has undoubtedly contributed to public support for the Wetland Reserve and for conservation in general, which is a promising sign for the future of environmental policy in Jordan.

These findings about Azraq itself show the way that over-pumping from an aquifer can have devastating political, economic, and physical consequences for the surrounding community and landscape. Government policy that does not adequately account for the sustainable yield of an aquifer or land that does not give consideration to how an aquifer can be preserved while being used for its water can be severely detrimental to the aquifer itself. Additionally, illegal water extraction can make it difficult for the government to know how much water it can sustainably pump from an aquifer, and more research is needed into how much water is being illegally extracted from Azraq and other water sources in Jordan at this time.

b. Connections to theoretical literature

This subsection is a discussion of the relationship between my own findings and observation and theoretical literature on two main theories: Ostrom’s tragedy of the commons and Inglehart’s post-materialist thesis. I attempt to answer the question, “How do my own findings relate to theoretical literature on groundwater governance and environmentalism?”. The findings I presented in this section, based both in my own observations and in existing literature on Azraq, provide useful insight into the application of various theories, particularly the tragedy of the commons and post-materialism, to the case of Azraq. Azraq provides a unique application of these theories in that it shows a community surrounding a common resource that is

being extracted primarily by an outside party (the Jordanian government) as opposed to the citizens themselves, arguably resulting in greater environmental awareness due to the citizens’ personal experiences of environmental degradation.

The Azraq aquifer was once a commonly shared resource, but as the need for water in Jordan rose, the government increasingly exercised control over Azraq’s water. As my data shows, many Azraq locals resent the government’s use of the aquifer and still view the aquifer as something that should belong to the people of the area. The situation in Azraq necessitates the question, “How are people affected when a common resource is seized and depleted by the government?” My answer to this question is that the effects of environmental degradation described in Elinor Ostrom’s theory of the “tragedy of the commons” still occur even when a common resource is not being depleted by its surrounding population. As stated in the literature review, Elinor Ostrom (1990) states that the “‘tragedy of the commons’ has come to symbolize the environmental degradation to be expected whenever many individuals use a scarce resource in common.” Clearly, a stipulation when applying the theory of the tragedy of the commons to a particular case study is that the resource must be a “common,” or shared, resource that only the members of the surrounding community have access to.

In Azraq, members of the community experience the negative effects of excessive groundwater pumping even though they are not legally able to pump from the aquifer themselves without specific licensing from the government. As the government continues water extraction from the aquifer, community members increasingly bear the brunt of environmental degradation. This environmental degradation, in turn, leads to shifts in society particularly regarding public opinion

of the government and support for conservation organizations. One could in fact argue that Azraq presents a counterexample to the theory of the tragedy of the commons as it applies to shared resources, as the community of Azraq would likely have been better off had control of the resource remained open to the community as opposed to the state. Alternatively, Azraq can simply be seen as a way that the same principle of the tragedy of the commons can be applied also to resources controlled and regulated by the state, as communities surrounding those resources will still experience the most negative consequences of environmental degradation.

On the topic of the tragedy of the commons, one final issue worth noting is illegal water extraction. Illegal water extraction is considered by the Jordanian government in particular to be a major contributor to the continuation of the water shortage. The government argues that knowing how much water can be extracted from the aquifer is difficult because it is unknown how much is being illegally extracted at the same time (Al-Zoubi, 2018). Current research is insufficient in determining whether the government's statement here is accurate or is simply an attempt to place the blame on illegal extraction rather than on the government itself. Either way, illegal extraction is applicable to the tragedy of the commons as it shows a way in which citizens are managing to still extract from the common resource - and are in turn contributing to the environmental degradation of their own community. Taking illegal extraction into account, we see water in Azraq as a tragedy of the commons that involves to some degree both common and state access, though the state activity is much more significant than that of the community.

This thesis thus uses Azraq to create an expansion of the tragedy of the commons - resources extracted not only by the sur-

rounding population but also by a state or national government can adversely affect the community surrounding the resource. The "tragedy" thus applies to all communities surrounding a resource being exploited by any party, particularly if the resource is water, as water is necessary for life. In cases such as Azraq, where the government is exploiting the resource rather than the community, the effects on the community are perhaps worse, as they are experiencing all of the cost and none of the benefit. Were the Azraq aquifer a common resource and community members were free to use the aquifer as they saw fit, a system of extraction that did not harm the surrounding landscape or community could potentially be arranged. However, since the government prioritizes the provision of water to the rest of Jordan over the preservation of the Azraq landscape, the community receives even harsher blows in the form of environmental degradation and destruction. My findings in Azraq thus suggest that a shared system of governance between surrounding communities and the state may be preferable to total control either by a community or by a state. This could involve quotas on extraction for both the community and the state, and granting of certain rights to the community such as using the resource for recreation or the maintenance of the resource for other economic sectors such as tourism. If shared control is unfeasible, consultation between the government and the community may be a way to ensure that the community experiences minimal effects of environmental degradation.

The other main theory I apply to Azraq is the post-materialist thesis. As described in the literature review, the post-materialist thesis as coined by Robert Inglehart (1971) essentially describes a phenomenon in which as societies move into a state of "post-materialism," when citizens no longer have to devote most of their time and energy to sim-

ply staying alive, individuals thus have more time and energy to devote to other, non-material issues. These issues often concern concepts of social justice and, of particular importance to this study, environmentalism. The theory of post-materialism predicts that in Azraq and in Jordan as a whole, as most citizens are generally low-income and do not live in a state of post-materialism, they would not place much importance on environmental issues as they do not have the time or energy to do so. My findings, however, suggest that in Azraq, this is not the case, and in this section I argue that Azraq presents a counterexample to the post-materialist thesis.

My data presented earlier in the findings shows that Azraq locals feel affected by the water crisis on a daily basis, and view the water crisis as a very important political issue in Jordan. Additionally, locals are very supportive of conservation movements and seem to have significant of the water crisis and government policy surrounding it. Undoubtedly, the experience of community members in Azraq with regards to the aquifer forces them to be well aware of these issues. Thus, in Azraq, it is not society's post-materialist status that makes it more aware of environmental issues, but in fact the opposite - the fact that locals in Azraq are generally low-income and many have historically depended on the aquifer for their way of life makes them more aware of environmental issues as they bear the brunt of negative environmental effects.

Table 3: Income of Azraq locals

Question	Total number of responses	Number of participants who answered "less than 1,000 JD (~\$1400)"	Number of participants who answered "more than 1,000 JD"
What is your monthly income?	21	21	0

The case of Azraq thus supports Tilt's idea of "empty-bellied environmentalism"

that I discussed in the literature review. Tilt argues that post-materialism perhaps accurately explains concern for the environment in post-materialist societies but fails to account for roughly equal levels of environmentalism in societies that are not post-materialist. Thus, he states that two types of environmentalism, "full-bellied" and "empty-bellied," take shape in more-developed and less-developed countries, respectively. In a place like Azraq, empty-bellied environmentalism takes place because low-income community members who perhaps depend on the aquifer, cannot afford to buy more water, or cannot find a job because the depletion of the aquifer has transformed the economy of the town, become very concerned about the environment because of the drastic effects of environmental change on their daily lives. This causes formation of conservationist ideologies and increased environmental consciousness in the community, which my data supports.

Conclusion

This paper has examined the case of Azraq within the context of existing literature on physical and political changes in the community, as well as the theories of the tragedy of the commons and post-materialism. Additionally, the findings of the study further the idea of water as an important link between state and society in Azraq as defined by Janssens and Thill. Overall, I found that the case of Azraq, having witnessed several societal and physical changes over the last half a century or so, provides new ways of understanding the tragedy of the commons and post-materialism in a world increasingly losing its water resources. In particular, my findings in Azraq show that citizens living near an exploited natural resource experience the negative effects of environmental degrada-

tion whether the exploitation comes from the community or from the state. Additionally, I argue that in cases such as Azraq, the effects of environmental degradation on a community surrounding a resource can be worse, as the community has no control over how much of the resource is being extracted, and is also unable to use the resource as it needs to. My findings suggest a shared system of governance between the state and the local community as a potential way to ameliorate the effects of environmental degradation on communities surrounding natural resources.

Azraq also provides a counterexample to Inglehart's post-materialist thesis as my findings indicate that those living in Azraq, a relatively low-income community that has not transitioned into a post-materialist society, in fact care greatly about the environment due to the harsh impacts of environmental degradation on their daily lives. In this way, the tragedy of the commons and post-materialism intersect when one examines Azraq - as citizens surrounding a resource experience the environmental degradation that comes with the depletion of that resource, they will in turn become more environmentally aware due to their experiences. Additionally, negative opinions towards government policy and potentially the government itself tend to manifest themselves in these communities, which could lead to political clashes between the government and the communities surrounding exploited natural resources. Thus, creating new ways of governing natural resources that involve input from both those living around a natural resource and the state is important in decreasing both the potential for conflict and the physical, economic, and social impacts of resource depletion on local populations.

References

- Al-Eisawi, D. (2005). Water Scarcity in Relation to Food Security and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity in Jordan. *Food Security Under Water Scarcity in the Middle East: Problems and Solutions*. Retrieved September 12, 2018.
- Al-Hreisha, H. (2018). Interviewed by Wesley Gerard. April 12, 2018.
- Al-Naber, M. (2016). Jordan - Azraq Basin Case Study: Groundwater Governance in the Arab World. International Water Management Institute. Retrieved September 12, 2018.
- Al-Zoubi, A. (2018). Interviewed by Wesley Gerard. April 16, 2018.
- Azraq Wetland Reserve. RSCN. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Booth, D. E. (2017). Postmaterialism and Support for the Environment in the United States. *Society & Natural Resources*, 30(11), 1404-1420. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Brechin, Steven R., and Willett Kempton (1994). *Global Environmentalism: A Challenge to the Postmaterialism Thesis?* Social Science Quarterly (University of Texas Press) 75 (2): 245-69. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Copeland, L. (2014). Value Change and Political Action: Postmaterialism, Political Consumerism, and Political Participation. *American Politics Research* 42(2), 257-82. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Gerard, W. (2018). Effects of the Jordanian Water Crisis on Public Opinion: A Case Study in Azraq. Retrieved March 30, 2019.
- Henn, Matt, Ben Oldfield, and James Hart (2018). Postmaterialism and Young People's Political Participation in a Time of Austerity. *The British Journal of Sociology* 69(3): 712-37. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Inglehart, R. (2006). The Silent Revolution in Europe: Intergenerational Change in Post-industrial Societies. *The American Political Science Review*, 100(4), 685-685. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Janssens, S., & Thill, Z. (2013). Water in Azraq (Jordan): A Fluid Link Between State and Society. *Journal Des Anthropologues*, (132-133), 317-338. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Molle, F., Al-Karablieh, E., Al-Naber, M., Closas, A., & Salman, A. (2017). Groundwater Governance in Jordan: The Case of Azraq Basin. International Water Management Institute. Retrieved September 12, 2018.
- Ostrom, E. (1990). *Governing the Commons*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Retrieved January 15, 2019.
- Ta'any, Rakad, Lama Masalha, Sa'eb Khresat, Tarek Ammari, and Alaeddin Tahboub. *Climate Change Adaptation: A Case Study in Azraq Basin, Jordan*. International Journal of Current Microbiology and Applied Sciences, 2014. Accessed January 14, 2019.
- Tilt, B. (2010). *The Struggle for Sustainability in Rural China: Environmental Values and Civil Society*. New York: Columbia University Press. Retrieved January 15, 2019.

Appendices

a. Survey Script

- (Q1) Gender: Male (1) Female (2)
- (Q2) Age: Younger than 20 (1), between 20-29 (2), between 30-39 (3), between 40 and 49 (4), older than 49 (5)
- (Q3) Monthly Income: Lower than 1,000 JD (1), Between 1,000 and 1,500 JD (2), more than 2,000 JD (3)
- (Q4) Compared to other political issues in Jordan, how do you view the water crisis? Unimportant (1), Very important (6)
- (Q5) How has the water crisis affected your daily life?
Not at all (1), In a big way (6)
- (Q6) Do you agree with the idea of pumping water from the Azraq aquifer to provide for the country?
Not at all (1), Strongly agree (6)
- (Q7) Do you agree that the agricultural sector has negatively affected the aquifer in Azraq?
Not at all (1), Strongly agree (6)
- (Q8) Do you support the current attempts to restore the Azraq aquifer?
Not at all (1), Strongly support (6)
- (Q9) Do you agree with the government’s policies regarding the water crisis in Azraq?
Not at all (1), Strongly agree (6)
- (Q10) Do you generally agree with the government’s policies regarding the water crisis in Jordan?
Not at all (1), Strongly agree (6)
- (Q11) How many times a week do you receive water from the government?
Once (1), Twice (2), Three times (3), Every day (4)

b. Sample Interview Script

- (Q1) How has the water crisis affected your daily life?
- (Q2) What obstacles do you face in accessing sufficient amounts of water?
- (Q3) How do you store water in your house?
- (Q4) How has the water crisis affected the lives of those in Azraq and in the Badia in general?
- (Q5) How do residents of Azraq and the Badia cope with the effects of the water crisis?
- (Q6) In your opinion, what have been both the positive and negative policies from the government regarding the water crisis in Jordan?
- (Q7) In your opinion, how has the water crisis affected the opinions of Jordanians towards the government and its policies?
- (Q8) What are the government policies regarding the water crisis that you would support in the future?